Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law

Volume 26

Editor-in-Chief

Heike Krieger, Department of Law/Public Law, Free University of Berlin, Berlin, Germany

Series Editors

Pablo Kalmanovitz, Department of International Studies, Instituto Tecnológico Autonómo de México (ITAM), Mexico City, Mexico

Eliav Lieblich, Buchmann Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel

Stavros Evdokimos Pantazopoulos, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, Athens, Greece

The *Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law* is a leading annual publication devoted to the study of international humanitarian law. It provides a truly international forum for high-quality, peer-reviewed academic articles focusing on this crucial branch of international law. Distinguished by contemporary relevance, the Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law bridges the gap between theory and practice and serves as a useful reference tool for scholars, practitioners, military personnel, civil servants, diplomats, human rights workers and students.

Heike Krieger · Pablo Kalmanovitz · Eliav Lieblich · Stavros Evdokimos Pantazopoulos Editors

Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law, Volume 26 (2023)

Humanitarian Actors





Editors Heike Krieger Department of Law/Public Law Free University of Berlin Berlin, Germany

Eliav Lieblich Buchmann Faculty of Law Tel Aviv University Tel Aviv, Israel Pablo Kalmanovitz Department of International Studies Instituto Tecnológico Autonómo de México (ITAM) Mexico City, Mexico

Stavros Evdokimos Pantazopoulos National and Kapodistrian University of Athens Athens, Greece

The views expressed in this *Yearbook* are not necessarily those of the members of the Editorial Board, the Board of Advisors to the Editorial Board, the Board of Recommendation and/or those institutions they represent, including the T.M.C. Asser Instituut and T.M.C. ASSER PRESS.

ISSN 1389-1359 ISSN 1574-096X (electronic) Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law ISBN 978-94-6265-662-8 ISBN 978-94-6265-663-5 (eBook) https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-663-5

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2025

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Cover art: ivanastar via iStock by Getty Images (https://www.istockphoto.com/nl/foto/moderne-abstra cte-achtergrond-met-kleurovergang-gm980931798-266452279)

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE, part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

If disposing of this product, please recycle the paper.

Editorial Board

General Editors

Prof. Heike Krieger (Editor-in-Chief), Free University of Berlin Prof. Pablo Kalmanovitz (Editor), Instituto Tecnológico Autónomo de México (ITAM), Mexico City Prof. Eliav Lieblich (Editor), Tel Aviv University

Managing Editor

Dr. Stavros Evdokimos Pantazopoulos, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens

Editorial Assistant

Baptiste Beurrier, T.M.C. Asser Instituut, The Hague

Board of Advisors to the Editorial Board

Dr. Louise Arimatsu, Centre for Women, Peace and Security, London School of Economics Dr. William Boothby, Geneva Centre for Security Policy Prof. Geoffrey Corn, Texas Tech University School of Law Dr. Hanne Cuyckens, Leiden University College Dr. Cordula Droege, International Committee of the Red Cross BGen. Prof. Paul Ducheine, Netherlands Defence Academy/University of Amsterdam Prof. Robin Geiß, United Nations Institute for Disarmament Research Prof. Dr. Wolff Heintschel von Heinegg, Europa Universität Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder) Prof. Dr. Jann K. Kleffner LL.M., Swedish Defence University Prof. Dr. Nils Melzer, International Committee of the Red Cross/University of Glasgow Prof. Dr. Héctor Olasolo, University of El Rosario, Colombia/The Hague University of Applied Sciences Dr. Christophe Paulussen, T.M.C. Asser Instituut, The Hague Jelena Pejic, Lieber Institute West Point/Just Security Dr. Kinga Tibori-Szabó, UN Iraq BGen Kenneth W. Watkin (Ret'd)/Former Judge Advocate General, Canada Prof. Dr. Gentian Zyberi, Norwegian Centre for Human Rights

Board of Recommendation

HRH Princess Margriet of the Netherlands, Honorary President of the Netherlands Red Cross Prof. Dr. Tim McCormack, University of Tasmania/Special Adviser on International Humanitarian Law to the Prosecutor of the International Criminal Court Prof. em. Dr. Horst Fischer, University of Leiden Dr. Dieter Fleck, Honorary President of the International Society for Military Law and the Law of War Prof. Terry D. Gill, University of Amsterdam H. E. Judge Christopher Greenwood, Master at Magdalene College, University of Cambridge Dr. Theodor Meron, Former Judge of the International Residual Mechanism for Criminal Tribunals H. E. Judge Dr. Fausto Pocar, International Court of Justice Prof. Dr. Michael N. Schmitt, University of Reading **Guest Reviewers** Prof. Dr. Constantine Antonopoulos, Democritus University of Thrace

Dr. Douglas Cubie, University College Cork

Dr. Grant Dawson, Wildlife Justice Commission

Prof. Dr. Treasa Dunworth, University of Auckland

Prof. Dr. Patrycja Grzebyk, University of Warsaw

Dr. Alonso Gurmendi Dunkelberg, London School of Economics and Political Science

Magistrate Dr. Julieta Lemaitre Ripoll, Special Jurisdiction for Peace

Dr. Alexander Wentker, Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law

Preface

International Humanitarian Law (IHL) arguably originates with the neutralization of battlefield medical assistance in the late nineteenth century. Since then, humanitarian actors have diversified and amplified their work and mission far beyond their founders' imagination, in a process that has contributed fundamentally to shaping contemporary IHL. Most notably, the International Red Cross and Red Crescent Movement has played fundamental roles in the drafting and enforcement of IHL instruments and has expanded its membership and mandate globally to cover humanitarian crises directly or indirectly linked to armed conflicts all over the world.

For volume 26, the Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law invited contributions that investigate the law, history, and politics of humanitarian action in armed conflicts and beyond. Common to the complex contemporary constellation of humanitarian actors is the espousal of a historically distinctive set of fundamental principles: humanity, neutrality, impartiality, and independence. In keeping with these principles, humanitarian actors have prioritized access to populations in need in conflict areas, often operating with discretion and confidentially. All humanitarian actors are forced to engage with *de facto* powers of various sorts in conflict areas, including High Contracting Parties, non-state opposition groups, terrorist organizations, and drug trafficking cartels with military capabilities. How is loyalty to humanitarian principles maintained in contexts that bear so little resemblance with historical battlefields—and in a political and legal world that increasingly demands criminal accountability and counter-terrorist action? Are the efforts of humanitarian actors excessively restricted by applicable legal frameworks?

The two contributions to the special theme address these questions and more. David Matyas's article conveys a rich sense of the legal complexity surrounding the work of humanitarian actors on the ground. Focusing on international nongovernmental organizations, international humanitarian organizations, and civil society actors, and drawing on interviews with humanitarian practitioners in Africa, the Middle East, Europe, and the United Kingdom, the author reconstructs the intricate configurations of international, domestic, and foreign state laws and jurisdictions; public and private laws; soft law standards and regulations, which constitute, constrain and enable, the "everyday work" of humanitarian actors. In the process, Matyas reveals the insufficiency of traditional legal approaches to humanitarian governance, which are framed within areas of public international law, and relativizes the role and practical importance of IHL in humanitarian action.

While Matyas's analysis of humanitarian legal governance focuses on non-state actors, Oscar Gómez's contribution looks at the state as a humanitarian actor. Challenging the perceived centrality of non-state actors in humanitarian practice, in which states appear as either benevolent funders or dysfunctional structures, Gómez shows the crucial importance of state agencies in aid-receiving states as effective providers of humanitarian relief and protection. Through a case study of Colombia's highly developed state humanitarian agencies, which have been dedicated to addressing the humanitarian impact of decades-long armed conflict, the article shows why we should see the state as a key humanitarian actor, not simply as either benevolent funder or helpless receiver.

In the general submissions section, Neil Davison looks at the exemption in the Chemical Weapons Convention for law enforcement operations, notably for "domestic riot control purposes." As Davison shows, while the CCW drafters had mainly tear gas in mind when introducing the law enforcement exemption, ambiguities in the treaty left open the question whether other toxic chemicals could be permissibly used in law enforcement, in particular aerosolized chemicals acting on the central nervous system. Davison's article reconstructs and reflects on the legal clarification introduced by the CCW Conference of the Parties in 2021, whereby the use of this type of chemicals was excluded from the law enforcement exemption. Davison highlights the crucial role of the ICRC in this clarification and identifies remaining ambiguities and open questions in the treaty.

The Russian aggression against Ukraine has brought the question to the fore of when a third state turns into a co-party to an international armed conflict because of the provision of support to a belligerent. In his contribution, Robin Sebastiaan David Sinnige digs into the specific case of the provision of processed satellite imagery. He argues that such a kind of intelligence support operates in a legal grey area because the pertinent standards are unclear in practice and in literature. Against this background, he proposes a new test consisting of three elements: the extent of the support, the causal link, and the intent. Based on this definition he concludes that in some instances the provision of tactical intelligence support entails a co-party status.

The Yearbook concludes with the Year in Review section, written by Belén Guerrero Romero, Wamika Sachdev, and Baptiste Beurrier.

We are grateful to the authors for their engagement with the Yearbook. Huge thanks are due to the peer-reviewers and to Baptiste Beurrier for his support with the editing process. We hope this edition contributes to the manifold discourses in international humanitarian law.

Mexico City, Mexico Berlin, Germany Tel Aviv, Israel Pablo Kalmanovitz Heike Krieger Eliav Lieblich

Contents

Part I Humanitarian Actors

1	Humanitarians and Their Law(s): A Comprehensive Inquiry David Matyas	3
2	The State as a Humanitarian Actor: Opportunitiesand Challenges in Decolonizing HumanitarianismOscar A. Gómez	43
Pa	rt II Other Articles	
3	Nerve Agents by Another Name: The Thirty-Year Effort to Close a Loophole on Chemical Weapons Neil Davison	77
4	On the Sideline or on the Pitch? The Classification of Third States Supporting Active Belligerents in an International Armed Conflict with Satellite Imagery Robin Sebastiaan David Sinnige	109
Pa	rt III Year in Review	
5	Year in Review 2023	157

Belén Guerrero Romero, Wamika Sachdev, and Baptiste Beurrier